



EduTrend Contents

P4C · RULES AND LAWS · MIDDLE SCHOOL

What Should Happen When Rules Are Broken?

Punishment, fairness and putting things right

Ages 11–13

Level: Intermediate

50 minutes

Circle and small groups
· up to 30

Activity 03

Inside: activity at a glance · step-by-step session plan · facilitator notes · 3 student worksheets · assessment checklist

ACTIVITY 03 · AT A GLANCE

What Should Happen When Rules Are Broken?

Students read an invented case: a student breaks a classmate's model on purpose. They compare four responses: a detention, paying for the model, a meeting where the student hears how the classmate feels and helps repair it, and no response at all. They create questions and enquire into the purpose of consequences.

Learning outcomes

By the end of the session students can:

- compare purposes of punishment;
- evaluate restorative approaches;
- reason about fairness;
- respect different views.

KEY WORDS

punishment · consequence ·
restore · deter · fair · repair

CURRICULUM LINKS

Citizenship: justice systems. PSHE:
conflict resolution. English:
persuasive writing.

1**STIMULUS**

Share something to
think about

2**THINK**

Quiet thinking time

3**QUESTION**

Create and choose
a question

4**ENQUIRE**

Reason together

5**BUILD**

Agree, disagree,
add

6**REFLECT**

Last words

Materials (per class)

- Case card
- Response cards
- Question and thinking-move cards
- Worksheets 1, 2 and 3

Before the session

- Read the stimulus and note possible concepts.
- Prepare question and thinking-move cards.
- Set out a circle so everyone can see each other.
- Print the worksheets.

SAFETY

Use the invented case only. Do not discuss real incidents involving pupils.

ACTIVITY 03 · SESSION PLAN

Step by step

Stay neutral: ask for reasons, examples and counter-examples rather than giving your own view.

Time	What happens	Say or ask
0–8 min Stimulus	Read the broken model case and the four responses.	<i>"What did you notice?"</i>
8–20 min Questions	Students create questions in pairs and vote on one.	<i>"Which question is most interesting to talk about?"</i>
20–44 min Enquiry	Enquire into the chosen question, building on each other's ideas.	<i>"What should happen when rules are broken?"</i>
44–50 min Last words	Each person says one last thought or passes.	<i>"Has your thinking changed?"</i>

CHALLENGE CARD (print or copy onto the board)

Argue which response is best and why.

ACTIVITY 03 · FACILITATOR NOTES

The philosophy in brief

Philosophers describe several aims of punishment, including retribution, deterrence, protection and reform.

Restorative approaches focus on repairing harm and relationships.

Common ideas to listen for

- “Punishment is only about revenge.” It has several aims.
- “Restorative means no consequences.” It involves responsibility.
- “The same response suits every case.” Context matters.

Adapting the activity

Support

Compare two responses.

Stretch

Design a fair response policy for your class.

WORKSHEET 1

Our questions

Name: _____ Class: _____ Date: _____

Write questions the stimulus makes you wonder about.

Our questions

Question	Who asked	Votes

WORKSHEET 2

Four responses

Evaluate.

Four responses

Response	Aim	Fair?
Detention		
Paying		
Restorative meeting		
No response		

WORKSHEET 3

Last words

Before and after.

Is punishment about the past or the future? Before the enquiry I thought...
Now I think... because...

FOR THE TEACHER

Assessment checklist

Use during the session. One sheet covers up to eight students; copy as needed.

Student	Asks a philosophical question	Gives reasons and examples	Listens and builds on others

Suggested codes: W = working towards · E = expected · G = greater depth

ABOUT THIS ACTIVITY

What Should Happen When Rules Are Broken? is a sample activity from the EduTrend Contents P4C Rules and Laws programme (middle school, level: intermediate). Every activity in the programme follows the same format: a practical challenge, a clear session plan, facilitator notes and ready-to-print worksheets, so that teachers, club leaders and parents can run it without extra preparation.

Full 15-, 20- and 32-week programmes are available from EduStore at edutrend.org.

© 2026 EduTrend Contents. This activity may be printed and copied for use with students in your own school, club or home. It may not be resold or published elsewhere. Photos: Akshar Dave / Unsplash.