



EduTrend Contents

P4C · FAIRNESS AND JUSTICE · MIDDLE SCHOOL

Punish or Repair?

What should happen when someone does wrong:
punishment, making amends or both?

Ages 12–14

Level: Intermediate

50 minutes

Circle and small groups
· up to 30

Activity 04

Inside: activity at a glance · step-by-step session plan · facilitator notes · 3 student worksheets · assessment checklist

ACTIVITY 04 · AT A GLANCE

Punish or Repair?

Students read an invented case: two students damage a bench in the school garden while messing about. Groups suggest responses: detention, paying for repairs, helping rebuild the bench, apologising to the gardening club, or nothing if it was an accident. They sort them into punishment and repair, then enquire into what justice is for.

Learning outcomes

By the end of the session students can:

- distinguish retribution, deterrence and repair;
- reason about intentions;
- evaluate responses to wrongdoing;
- propose a fair response.

KEY WORDS

justice · punishment · deterrence ·
restorative · harm · amends

CURRICULUM LINKS

Citizenship: law and justice. PSHE:
relationships. RE: forgiveness.

1

STIMULUS

Share something to
think about

2

THINK

Quiet thinking time

3

QUESTION

Create and choose
a question

4

ENQUIRE

Reason together

5

BUILD

Agree, disagree,
add

6

REFLECT

Last words

Materials (per class)

- Case card
- Response cards
- Question and thinking-move cards
- Worksheets 1, 2 and 3

Before the session

- Read the stimulus and note possible concepts.
- Prepare question and thinking-move cards.
- Set out a circle so everyone can see each other.
- Print the worksheets.

SAFETY

Keep to the invented case. Do not discuss real incidents involving students.

ACTIVITY 04 · SESSION PLAN

Step by step

Stay neutral: ask for reasons, examples and counter-examples rather than giving your own view.

Time	What happens	Say or ask
0–8 min Stimulus	Read the garden bench case.	<i>"What did you notice?"</i>
8–20 min Questions	Students create questions in pairs and vote on one.	<i>"Which question is most interesting to talk about?"</i>
20–44 min Enquiry	Enquire into the chosen question, building on each other's ideas.	<i>"What is the point of punishment?"</i>
44–50 min Last words	Each person says one last thought or passes.	<i>"Has your thinking changed?"</i>

CHALLENGE CARD (print or copy onto the board)

Propose a response to the bench case that you think is just, and explain its purpose.

ACTIVITY 04 · FACILITATOR NOTES

The philosophy in brief

Punishment can aim at deserved payback, deterring future wrongs or protecting others; restorative approaches focus on repairing harm.

Many schools use restorative conversations alongside sanctions.

Common ideas to listen for

- “Harsher is always fairer.” Proportion matters.
- “Repair means no consequences.” It is a consequence.
- “Intentions don’t matter.” They often change the response.

Adapting the activity

Support

Provide response cards to sort.

Stretch

Compare with how a court decides a sentence.

WORKSHEET 1

Our questions

Name: _____

Class: _____ Date: _____

Write questions the stimulus makes you wonder about.

Our questions

Question	Who asked	Votes

WORKSHEET 2

Punish or repair?

Sort and judge.

Punish or repair?

Response	Punish or repair	Fair? Why

WORKSHEET 3

Last words

Before and after.

Is repairing harm better than punishing? Before the enquiry I thought... Now I think... because...

FOR THE TEACHER

Assessment checklist

Use during the session. One sheet covers up to eight students; copy as needed.

Student	Asks a philosophical question	Gives reasons and examples	Listens and builds on others

Suggested codes: W = working towards · E = expected · G = greater depth

ABOUT THIS ACTIVITY

Punish or Repair? is a sample activity from the EduTrend Contents P4C Fairness and Justice programme (middle school, level: intermediate). Every activity in the programme follows the same format: a practical challenge, a clear session plan, facilitator notes and ready-to-print worksheets, so that teachers, club leaders and parents can run it without extra preparation.

Full 15-, 20- and 32-week programmes are available from EduStore at edutrend.org.

© 2026 EduTrend Contents. This activity may be printed and copied for use with students in your own school, club or home. It may not be resold or published elsewhere. Photos: Thomas Delacrétaz / Unsplash.